

Robert E. Cartwright, Jr., Esq. (SBN: 104284)
David G. Yen, Esq. (SBN: 234550)
THE CARTWRIGHT LAW FIRM, INC.
222 Front Street, Fifth Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 433-0444 Fax: (415) 433-0449

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Hadel Shafi, individually, Hadel Shafi as Guardian Ad Litem for
Dannah Shafi, Dannah Shafi, Areeg Shafi, Rami Shafi

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
for the
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

HADEL SHAFI, Individually, HADEL
SHAFI, as Guardian Ad Litem for DANNAH
SHAFI, DANNAH SHAFI, AREEG SHAFI,
RAMI SHAFI,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

UNITED AIR LINES, INC. (a corporation)
doing business as UNITED AIRLINES, UAL
CORPORATION (a corporation) UNITED
CONTINENTAL HOLDINGS, INC. (a
corporation) and DOES 1 through 30,
inclusive,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. CV 12-4451 WHO

**PETITION AND ORDER TO APPROVE
COMPROMISE OF DISPUTED CLAIM
OF MINOR D.S.**

Honorable William H. Orrick
United States District Judge

Comes now ATEF IBRAHIM, as Guardian Ad Litem for Minor Plaintiff Dannah Shafi,
otherwise referred to as Plaintiff D.S., by and through his counsel The Cartwright Law Firm,
(hereinafter "Petitioner") and respectfully represents:

1. Wherefore the matter of Hadel Shafi, et al. v. United Air Lines, Inc., et al.
settled before Magistrate Judge Kandis A. Westmore on July 26, 2013.

1 2. Wherefore the terms of the settlement were as follows: Defendant United Air
2 Lines, Inc. would pay a total of \$67,500 to be divided equally among Plaintiffs Rami Shafi,
3 Areeg Shafi, and D.S. Therefore, Plaintiff D.S.'s share of the settlement would be \$22,500,
4 before attorney's fees and costs.

5
6 3. Attorney's fees as to Plaintiff D.S., set at 25%, came to \$5,270.81. Litigation
7 expenses were \$1,416.76. Plaintiff D.S.'s net recovery therefore came out to \$15,812.00.

8
9 4. Wherefore Plaintiff D.S. is a daughter to Plaintiff Decedent Max Shafi, who
10 died on October 21, 2010 after losing consciousness while aboard a United Airlines flight from
11 London to San Francisco on August 29, 2010. Plaintiff D.S. brought a claim for the loss of
12 companionship, love, comfort, support, and affection resulting from the death of Plaintiff
13 Decedent Max Shafi.

14
15 5. Wherefore the settlement of minor D.S. is fair and reasonable for the following
16 reason: This was an extremely difficult case of liability against Defendant United Air Lines.
17 Plaintiff Decedent Max Shafi had a long history of illness, including end stage liver disease.
18 Plaintiffs acknowledged they would have an uphill battle proving causation at trial.
19 Additionally, Plaintiff Rami Shafi's account of what transpired aboard the plane is
20 uncorroborated by every other witness on the flight. While Plaintiff D.S. enjoyed a close
21 relationship with Max Shafi, she did not reside with Max Shafi at the time of his death and Mr.
22 Shafi was absent for a period of five years from her life from 2002 to 2007.

23
24 6. Plaintiff D.S. incurred no medical expenses as a result of the death of Plaintiff
25 Decedent Max Shafi. There is also no documented loss of financial support from Max Shafi.
26 Max Shafi was not ordered to pay child support as a result of the dissolution of marriage to
27 former Plaintiff Hadel Shafi.
28
29

Dated: October 1, 2013

Robert E. Cartwright, Jr.
David G. Yen
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Based on the above representations, the COURT hereby approves the settlement of Plaintiff D.S.

Dated: October 3, 2013

W. A. De

Honorable William H. Orrick
United States District Judge